

# Permian vegetational Pompeii from Inner Mongolia and its implications for landscape paleoecology and paleobiogeography of Cathaysia

Jun Wang<sup>a,1</sup>, Hermann W. Pfefferkorn<sup>b,1</sup>, Yi Zhang<sup>c</sup>, and Zhuo Feng<sup>d</sup>

<sup>a</sup>State Key Laboratory of Palaeobiology and Stratigraphy, Nanjing Institute of Geology and Palaeontology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Nanjing 210008, China; <sup>b</sup>Department of Earth and Environmental Science, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA 19104-6316; <sup>c</sup>Institute of Palaeontology, Shenyang Normal University, Shenyang 110034, China; and <sup>d</sup>Yunnan Key Laboratory for Palaeobiology, Yunnan University, Kunming 650091, China

Edited\* by David L. Dilcher, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN, and approved January 24, 2012 (received for review September 13, 2011)

Plant communities of the geologic past can be reconstructed with high fidelity only if they were preserved in place in an instant in time. Here we report such a flora from an early Permian (ca. 298 Ma) ash-fall tuff in Inner Mongolia, a time interval and area where such information is filling a large gap of knowledge. About 1,000 m<sup>2</sup> of forest growing on peat could be reconstructed based on the actual location of individual plants. Tree ferns formed a lower canopy and either *Cordaites*, a coniferophyte, or *Sigillaria*, a lycopsid, were present as taller trees. Noeggerathiales, an enigmatic and extinct spore-bearing plant group of small trees, is represented by three species that have been found as nearly complete specimens and are presented in reconstructions in their plant community. Landscape heterogeneity is apparent, including one site where Noeggerathiales are dominant. This peat-forming flora is also taxonomically distinct from those growing on clastic soils in the same area and during the same time interval. This Permian flora demonstrates both similarities and differences to floras of the same age in Europe and North America and confirms the distinct character of the Cathaysian floral realm. Therefore, this flora will serve as a baseline for the study of other fossil floras in East Asia and the early Permian globally that will be needed for a better understanding of paleoclimate evolution through time.

coal-swamp plant community | plant paleoecology | volcanic ash-fall tuff | Wuda

The understanding of paleoecosystems in Earth's deep past ideally requires the reconstruction of actual sites of ancient plant communities. Only vegetation buried in growth position in a geological instant can offer such an unbiased window into the composition and ecology of ancient vegetation, which in turn enhances larger scale paleoecological and paleoclimatic interpretations (1, 2). Early Permian floras are of particular importance because they represent a time of oscillating climatic changes during transitions between icehouse and greenhouse times that might serve as an analog for modern global vegetational change (3). These catastrophically preserved floras, which capture the composition of vegetation in a specific area and at a moment in time, can be generated by various types of volcanic action or flooding, of which volcanic air-fall tuffs produce the most reliable representation of the existing vegetation (1). Such occurrences have not been described frequently from Paleozoic rocks, but those that have been reconstructed have been Carboniferous in age (2, 4–7) (i.e., older than the one described here). Other published reconstructions of fossil vegetation have been mostly conceptual approximations because they were based on different types of depositional systems in which preservational biases had to be taken into consideration (8).

Our identification (9) and quantitative analysis and characterization of a peat-forming forest preserved in an air-fall tuff in Inner Mongolia (Fig. 1) enables us to reconstruct the actual vegetation for an area of more than 1,000 m<sup>2</sup>. The complexity the reconstruction reveals contributes significantly to a more

complete understanding of paleoecology and paleophytogeography of tropical vegetation of the earliest Permian. This quantitative spatial reconstruction represents the only Carboniferous or Permian flora reconstructed so far in East Asia and is a unique example of peat-forming flora from the Permian that allows for such a detailed analysis. This flora records heterogeneity of vegetation on the landscape scale and demonstrates similarities and differences between the Cathaysian and Euramerican floral realms of the Early Permian. Three additional reconstructions of noeggerathialean plants emerge from the analysis of this flora and add significantly to our understanding of the ecological role played by this enigmatic group.

The Wuda coal field is located on the northwest margin of the Helanshan mountain chain. The volcanic-tuff bed lies between coal seams No. 6 and No. 7, which occur in a syncline (N39°28'48" to N39°33'36", E106°36'36" to E106°39'36") of about 20 km<sup>2</sup> (Fig. 1). The vegetation preserved in the tuff grew on the peat that later formed coal No. 7 (9). The tuff is of early Permian age, based on the floral composition and its uppermost position in the Taiyuan Formation (10), which is assigned a late Carboniferous through early Permian age in North China based on marine invertebrates and regional correlations (11). During Permian times, Wuda was located on the northwest part of the North China Block, which appeared as a large island/microcontinent in the tropical zone in the paleo-Tethys Ocean (9, 12).

The peat-forming forest was preserved in a manner similar to the towns of Pompeii and Herculaneum (13) by a smothering volcanic ash-fall. This ash-fall buried and killed the plants, broke off twigs and leaves, toppled trees, and preserved the forest remains in place within the ash layer. The layer is now 66-cm thick after compaction and lithification. The original thickness can only be estimated at this point but would have been about 100 cm, based on compaction features visible in the fossil plants. The thickness of the ash layer is relatively consistent over the area of current exposure, which has a north-south extension of over 10 km. From these data it appears that the volcanic eruption was quite large and the area covered with tuff was quite extensive.

Systematical excavation of the volcanic tuff in quadrats at three different sites (see *Materials and Methods* for procedures used) allowed reconstruction of the actual spatial distribution of stems and other plant parts.

Author contributions: J.W. and H.W.P. designed research; J.W., H.W.P., Y.Z., and Z.F. performed research; J.W., H.W.P., and Y.Z. contributed new reagents/analytic tools; J.W., H.W.P., Y.Z., and Z.F. analyzed data; and J.W. and H.W.P. wrote the paper.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Freely available online through the PNAS open access option.

\*This Direct Submission article had a prearranged editor.

<sup>1</sup>To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: jun.wang@nigpas.ac.cn or hpfeffer@sas.upenn.edu.

This article contains supporting information online at [www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1073/pnas.1115076109/-DCSupplemental](http://www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1073/pnas.1115076109/-DCSupplemental).









**Fig. 5.** Reconstruction of actual site 3 (of Figs. 1 and 2) of a peat-forming forest of earliest Permian age that was preserved by a volcanic ash-fall near Wuda, Inner Mongolia, China. The upper-story trees are *Sigillaria* (an extinct tree lycopsid) that are carrying bundles of cones below their tuft of narrow leaves. The lower-story forest is made up of several species of Marattialean tree ferns that are characterized by a brown root mantle in the lower part of the stem and dead leaves hanging down. The other component of the lower-story forest is a species of *Paratingia*, a representative of the Noeggerathiales, present here in five individuals. Other smaller trees shown from left to right carry *Tingia*, *Pterophyllum*, and *Taeniopteris* foliage. A *Sphenopteris* species appears as a vine on two tree-fern root mantles. An herb layer existed only in some areas and is shown in the right foreground with *Sphenophyllum*, belonging to an extinct group of sphenopsids, and *N. feminaeformis*, a representative of the extinct fern family Zygotpteridaceae. The peat was covered most of the time by a few centimeters of standing water protecting it from oxidation.

mostly in extrabasinal settings in Euramerica and are taxonomically distinct from those reported here.

In Euramerica, lycopsid-dominated forests in peat-forming environments were replaced by tree-fern forests during the Middle-Late Pennsylvanian transition (35, 36). This transition is not the case in Cathaysia. Compared with particularly well-analyzed Pennsylvanian coal-swamp communities before (4–6, 27) or after (2) the transition, the Wuda flora described here is remarkably short of pteridosperms, and has a lower diversity of lycopsids and a greater diversity of tree ferns, apart from above-mentioned common occurrence of Noeggerathiales and possible early cycads.

Terrestrial vegetation presents a progressive increase in provinciality in the Late Paleozoic, resulting in four floral realms: Gondwanan and Angaran in the southern and northern middle-to-high paleolatitudes, and Euramerican and Cathaysian in the subtropical to tropical paleolatitudes (37). The Gondwanan and Angaran floras are quite distinct and easily recognizable, but the Euramerican (in present day Europe and North America) and Cathaysian (in present day China and east Asia) floras are similar in many respects, and their relationship has been discussed as a concern in Late Paleozoic paleophytogeography (33, 34, 38, 39). In our opinion, Permo-Carboniferous taxa shared by China,

Europe, and North America (33) are expected because in the Carboniferous and Permian both areas shared elements of a global tropical rain forest biome (i.e., the same large-scale ecosystem) (40). However, there are distinct differences at the specific level among the common genera from China/East Asia and those from Europe/North America. Additionally, such genera as are held in common (33) come from different time intervals, respectively the Pennsylvanian of Euramerica and the Early Permian of China. Furthermore, as the present study shows, significant differences in the distribution and ecology of some groups (e.g., Noeggerathiales) exist between Cathaysia and Euramerica. Thus, there are clear paleophytogeographic differences that justify the separation into Euramerican and Cathaysian floral realms. It is important to maintain the distinction between large-scale climate ecology (i.e., biomes) versus regional taxonomic differences (i.e., biogeography).

#### Materials and Methods

The tuff is exposed in exploratory cuts or near mine-tunnel openings. To reach the tuff over an area large enough to carry out quantitative sampling, substantial amounts of overburden have to be removed, which requires the use of heavy machinery. Mining in connection with a coal fire-extinguishing project (41) systematically removed all near-surface coal seams, providing access to the volcanic tuff over hundreds of square meters

at a time. The 66-cm thick tuff layer was then broken up by a power shovel but the blocks left in place. A grid was established and the blocks in each grid section investigated in turn. The blocks of tuff were split and the plant fossils recorded together with the size of the specimen (= quadrat) according to established methods (42) that were modified slightly in the present study.

The actual size of each quadrat was recorded. At the same time, the size of quadrats was kept more or less equal based on the general pattern of rock fracture. The average quadrat size in the first site (Fig. 1 C, 1) is about 10.5 cm × 13.0 cm; that of the second site (Fig. 1C, 2) is 9.4 cm × 13.6 cm; that of the third site (Fig. 1C, 3) is 7.6 cm × 13.0 cm. The average quadrat size in all three sites is about 8.2 cm × 13.2 cm. For any of a specific area or the whole area of a specific site, the analyses were done twice, once with the actual size of the

counting quadrats and another time assuming that all quadrats were equal. The two results were so similar that the simpler method was used for all other areas. In other words, the coverage can be calculated assuming that all quadrats were of equal size, and the frequency of occurrence generally reflected the coverage (Figs. S1–S6 and Dataset S1).

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.** We thank the Shenhua Coal Company for their cooperation during field research; Mr. Zhang Haiwang, who in cooperation with the coal fire-extinguishing project, helped to get access to relatively large areas of the exposed tuff layer; and Ren Yugao, who painted the reconstructions. This research was jointly supported by the Chinese Academy of Science Project KZCX2-EW-120, National Basic Research Program of China (973 Program, 2012CB821901), and the National Natural Science Foundation of China (to J.W.); and a grant of the Research Foundation of the University of Pennsylvania (to H.W.P.).

- DiMichele WA, Falcon-Lang HJ (2011) Pennsylvanian 'fossil forests' in growth position ( $T^0$  assemblages): Origin, taphonomic bias and palaeoecological insights. *J Geol Soc London* 168:585–605.
- DiMichele WA, Falcon-Lang HJ, Nelson WJ, Elrick SD, Ames PR (2007) Ecological gradients within a Pennsylvanian mire forest. *Geology* 35:415–418.
- Gastaldo RA, DiMichele WA, Pfefferkorn HW (1996) Out of the icehouse into the greenhouse: A Late Paleozoic analog for modern global vegetational change. *GSA Today* 6(10):1–7.
- Gastaldo RA, Stevanović-Walls IM, Ware WN, Greb SF (2004) Community heterogeneity of early Pennsylvanian peat mires. *Geology* 32:693–696.
- Opluštil S, et al. (2009) A middle Pennsylvanian (Bolsovian) peat-forming forest preserved in situ in volcanic ash of the Whetstone Horizon in the Radnice basin, Czech Republic. *Rev Palaeobot Palynol* 155:234–274.
- Opluštil S, et al. (2009) Composition and structure of an in situ middle Pennsylvanian peat-forming plant assemblage buried in volcanic ash, Radnice basin (Czech Republic). *Palaios* 24:726–746.
- Wagner RH (1989) A late Stephanian forest swamp with *Sporangiostrobus* fossilized by volcanic ash fall in the Puertollano basin, central Spain. *Int J Coal Geol* 12:523–552.
- Behrensmeier AK, Hook RW (1992) *Terrestrial Ecosystems Through Time, Evolutionary Paleocology of Terrestrial Plants and Animals*, eds Behrensmeier AK, et al. (The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, London), pp 15–136.
- Pfefferkorn HW, Wang J (2007) Early Permian coal-forming floras preserved as compressions from the Wuda District (Inner Mongolia, China). *Int J Coal Geol* 69:90–102.
- He ZX, Yang H, Yuan XQ (2004) *Atlas of Geology Profile in Ordos Basin*. (Petroleum Industry Press, Beijing), pp 89–94. (Chinese)
- Wang J (2010) Late Paleozoic macrofloral assemblages from Weibei Coalfield, with reference to vegetational change through the Late Paleozoic Ice-age in the North China Block. *Int J Coal Geol* 83:292–317.
- Ziegler AM, Hulver ML, Rowley DB (1997) *Late Glacial and Postglacial Environmental Change, Quaternary, Carboniferous-Permian, and Proterozoic*, ed Martini IP (Oxford Univ Press, New York), pp 111–146.
- Meyer FG (1980) Carbonized food plants of Pompeii, Herculaneum, and the Villa at Torre Annunziata. *Econ Bot* 34:401–437.
- Wang J, Feng Z, Zhang Y, Wang S (2009) Confirmation of *Sigillaria* Brongniart as a coal-forming plant in Cathaysia: Occurrence from an Early Permian autochthonous peat-forming flora in Inner Mongolia. *Geol J* 44:480–493.
- Pfefferkorn HW, Wang J (2009) *Stigmariopsis*, *Stigmaria asiatica*, and the survival of the *Sigillaria brardii-ichthyolepis* group in the tropics of the late Pennsylvanian and Early Permian. *Palaeoworld* 18:130–135.
- Wang J (2006) *Tingia unita* sp. nov. (Noeggerathiales) with strobilus from the Lower Permian of Wuda, Inner Mongolia, China. *Chin Sci Bull* 51:2624–2633.
- Wang J, Pfefferkorn HW, Bek J (2009) *Paratingia wudensis* sp. nov., a whole noeggerathialean plant preserved in an earliest Permian air fall tuff in Inner Mongolia, China. *Am J Bot* 96:1676–1689.
- Scheihing MH, Pfefferkorn HW (1984) The taphonomy of land plants in the Orinoco Delta: A model for the incorporation of plant parts in clastic sediments of Late Carboniferous age of Euramerica. *Rev Palaeobot Palynol* 41:205–240.
- Wing SL, Hickey LJ, Swisher CC (1993) Implications of an exceptional fossil flora for Late Cretaceous vegetation. *Nature* 363:342–344.
- Mueller-Dombois D, Ellenberg H (1974) *Aims and Methods of Vegetation Ecology* (John Wiley and Sons, New York).
- Leary RL, Pfefferkorn HW (1977) An early Pennsylvanian flora with *Megalopteris* and Noeggerathiales from West-Central Illinois. *Illinois State Geol Surv Cir* 500:1–77.
- Li XX, Shen GL, Tian BL, Wang SJ, Ouyang S (1995) *Fossil Floras of China Through the Geological Ages*, eds Li XX, et al. (Guangdong Science and Technology Press, Guangzhou), pp 244–302.
- Tian B, Wang SJ, Guo YT, Chen GR, Zhao H (1996) Flora of Palaeozoic coal balls of China. *Palaeobotanist* 45:247–254.
- Wang SJ, Tian BL, Guo YT (1995) Palaeocommunity and its succession of peat swamp of No. 7 Seam in Xishan Coalfield. *Journal of China Coal Society* 20(1):88–92.
- Wang SJ, Sun KQ, Cui JZ, Ma SM (2009) *Fossil Plants from Coal Balls in China* (Higher Education Press, Beijing) pp 1–141. (Chinese)
- DiMichele WA, Pfefferkorn HW, Phillips TL (1996) Persistence of Late Carboniferous tropical vegetation during glacially driven climatic and sea-level fluctuations. *Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol* 125:105–128.
- Gastaldo RA (1987) Confirmation of Carboniferous clastic swamp communities. *Nature* 326:869–871.
- Xu R, Wang XQ (1982) *Reconstruction of the Vegetation from Some Representative Regions in China Through the Geological Times* (Science Press, Beijing), pp 1–50. (Chinese)
- Ouyang S, Zhu HC, Gao F (2003) Early Early Permian spores from coals of the Heidaigou Coal-Mine, Jungar Qi, Nei Mengol: A case study of Palaeoecology. *Acta Palaeontologica Sin* 42:428–441.
- Zhang H (1990) Plant constitution of permineralized peat forming Palaeozoic coals in north half of Shanxi and the influence to coal quality. *Bulletin of Central Coal Mining Research Institute, Xi'an Branch* 4:17–25.
- Lee HH (1963) Fossil plants of the Yuehmenkou Series, North China. *Palaeontologica Sinica* 148(New Series A, 6):1–185.
- Gu, Zhi (1974) *An Introduction to Chinese Fossils, Palaeozoic Plants from China* (Science Press, Beijing). (Chinese)
- Hilton J, et al. (2002) *Callospermion* ovules from the Early Permian of northern China: palaeofloristic and palaeogeographic significance of callistophytealean seed-ferns in the Cathaysian flora. *Rev Palaeobot Palynol* 120:301–314.
- Hilton J, Wang SJ, Galtier J, Li CS (2001) An Early Permian plant assemblage from the Taiyuan Formation of northern China with compression/impression and permineralized preservation. *Rev Palaeobot Palynol* 114:175–189.
- Pfefferkorn HW, Thomson MC (1982) Changes in dominance patterns in Upper Carboniferous plant-fossil assemblages. *Geology* 10:641–644.
- DiMichele WA, Phillips TL (1996) in *Biotic Recovery from Mass Extinction Events*, ed Hart MB (Geological Society, London) Special Publication 102:201–221.
- Wnuk C (1996) The development of floristic provinciality during the Middle and Late Paleozoic. *Rev Palaeobot Palynol* 90:5–40.
- Cleal CJ, Wang ZQ (2002) A new and diverse plant fossil assemblage from the upper Westphalian Benxi Formation, Shanxi, China, and its palaeofloristic significance. *Geol Mag* 139:107–130.
- Hilton J, Cleal CJ (2007) The relationship between Euramerican and Cathaysian tropical floras in the Late Paleozoic: palaeobiogeographical and palaeogeographical implications. *Earth Sci Rev* 85:85–116.
- Breckle SW (2002) *Walter's Vegetation of the Earth* (Springer, Heidelberg).
- Web page of Chinese coal-fire extinguishing project <http://www.in-en.com/coal/html/coul-20072007051891371.html>. Accessed May 18, 2007.
- Pfefferkorn HW, Mustafa H, Hass H (1975) Quantitative Charakterisierung oberkarboner Abdruckfloren [Quantitative characterization of compression-impression floras of Upper Carboniferous age]. *N Jb Geol Palaeont Abh*, 150:253.269. German.